

## THURSDAY JANUARY 22, 2009 WORKSHOP

**Present:** John Daly, Shannon Lecuyer, Sandra Gibson-Quigley, Michael Penney, Kelly Davila, Brian Morse, Ann Weeks, Philip Hureau, Tim Corcoran, Henry Zussman

**Not Present:** *Nora Werme (Webster), Darlene Finnemore (Webster), Ed Belbin (Mid terms being given at Westborough), Sarah Kaye (Math placement tests being given at AKFCS), Rosemarie Ward (Worcester),*

### HOUSEKEEPING:

#### SIGN IN

**INTRODUCTION:** *Tom gave an overview of the day. There was a brief discussion about "collections" of Native American artifacts (garments made of seal intestines, human remains, etc.) from the "East India Marine Society of Salem". AAS will become the premier collector after the 1830's.*

- **9:10-10:00 A.M. "SHADOWS IN THE STREAM": HISTORIOGRAPHY AND VANISHING INDIANS – TOM DOUGHTON**

### NINETEENTH CENTURY PERCEPTIONS ABOUT THE "DISAPPEARANCE" OF THE NATIVE AMERICANS

- *"To Demand a Tear from the Eye of Humanity"---the assumption of 19<sup>th</sup> century scholars that the peoples of Central New England had disappeared—even while they were still under guardianship in Massachusetts...people without history, people without a place... 'like shadows in the stream'*
- *The fate of most if not all the tribes in New England was to disappear (according to local historians—many of whom decried their disappearance, some of whom considered it Providential (Hudson).*
- *Whether for or against the disappearance of the Indians, virtually all historians/sociologists opposed the violent and purposeful destruction---"their descent to extermination should be easy,..." (Wm Tudor to Phi Beta Kappa Society Cambridge 1819)*
- *Tom read at length from a variety of 19<sup>th</sup> century sources that testified to the sad but inexorable disappearance of Indians. Many deplored their disappearance—many faulting the whites for causing it, but virtually all considered it to be unavoidable. Using images of "fading into the wind.... Autumn leaves...shadows...", etc... they describe the purported annihilation of*

*the Indians. \*Many of these images appear in the poetry selections posted on the web site under the title, "Sample Antebellum Poetry with Indian Themes" (also available in pdf format)*

- *Opposition between civilized, "improving" Whites and "semi-barbarous" Indians was also a frequent theme. Natives might be seen as a 'much oppressed' race whose remnants ought to be preserved (and improved). Few expressed outright doubt about the "right" of Euro-Americans to occupy (and improve) the land. There was no doubt that 'improvement' was right—even with its sad and terrible cost to the Indians.*
- *"Unavoidable natural causes.....proximity to whites..." led to the demise of the Indians.*
- *Tom pointed out that the historiography of the period is 'hackneyed'.....a rhetorically florid compilation of clichés justifying the 'disappearance' and 'extinction' of the Indians in favor of the inevitable spread of white civilization.*
- *Even when sympathetic the commentators regard the disappearance of the 'red man' as inevitable and irrevocable.....*
- *In reality from 1620-1750 many thousands of Indians" disappeared" through war, disease, enslavement—but they did not completely disappear. In 1825 there were still some 97000 Native Americans East of the Mississippi living on some 70 million acres of land...including a significant number in New England...*
- *Q&A—why did people who were acting as guardians—or employing Indians as servants--in many cases continue to assert that the Indians had disappeared? Was it in order to fabricate a moral justification for taking land because 'no one was there anymore' or, because the remnant "didn't act/look like Indians"....didn't fit the mold....had lost any connection to their original languages...had their racial purity diluted...etc. Was it because the political structure of the various tribes had been weakened, or, that the loss of property had reduced them to isolated individuals and families without any corporate identity?*

**10:00 - 10:10 - Break**

- **10:10-11 a. m. "The Perfect Accessory": Native Americans Represented in Visual & Plastic Arts - PowerPoint presentation by Tom Doughton**
- *Tom presented images of Niagara Falls (from a purported native point of view)...Niagara as one of the penultimate symbols of America.... The first image was of tiny Native Americans as accessories to the huge Niagara Falls. This would be repeated over and over again in the early sets paintings/engravings. The natives tend to "disappear" after the first decades of the 19<sup>th</sup> century as buildings and other evidence of Euro-American expansion into the region becomes evident.*

*There are a number of themes to consider in the images*

- *Images of Indians as antiquity—the pre history of Euro-Americans*
- *Indians as part of nature vs. Euros as part of civilization*
- *Representations of Indians as violent, cruel savages, etc.*

*We looked at specific images of:*

- *An early European images of the Falls from “The Gentleman’s Magazine” London,1751*
- *Falls from above c 1762-68 by Thomas Davis with Indians and a bald eagle*
- *Promotion of the Falls as one of the wonders of North America, of the immensity of the American wilderness—with Native Americans miniaturized in background or foreground as symbols of the primeval wilderness.*
- *Vanderbilt painting, John Trumbull painting with British soldiers and natives 1807; Thomas Cole painted at least 3 representations of the falls with Indians; Alvin Fisher “The Great Horseshoe Falls” ( with multiple mini Indians).*
- *In one 1809 portrayal we saw Niagara as emblem of America—with palm trees!*
- *John James Barralet’s, “Science Unveiling “The Beauties Of Nature To The Genius Of America” 1814 included an angelic figure and a multi-breasted woman (representing fecundity and plenty?)as well as very large animals of various types*
- *By the 1830’s the Falls appear with buildings in the background...and no Indians—a, perhaps unconscious, reiteration of the belief that as ‘civilization’ makes progress the ‘savages’ must disappear.*
- *Tom presented a painting of an Indian family at the Pacific coast—facing westward at sunset—with nowhere left to go. The image is an artistic rendition of the melancholy but inevitable fate of native peoples.*
- *In a painting of the “Kidnapping of the daughter of Daniel Boone” .... Savage Indians are portrayed taking away a Madonna like girl with her hands clasped in prayer...The Indians look apprehensive—as if they know the futility of what they are doing.*

- *There are further images of dancing Indians and watchful Indians (as Henry Hudson arrives on the “Hudson” River)*
- *In addition to the pictures of Indians there are mythological images of European arrivals---well dressed pilgrims landing on the rocks at Plymouth (why would you aim for the rocks when you are entering the best natural harbor in southern New England?)*
- *“Indian Vespers”—by Durand seems to depict a sunrise (?)--is it the rising light of civilization and the declining sun of savagery?*
- *Sir John Johnson (the 18<sup>th</sup> century British Indian agent in New York) is depicted with ghostly Indian in the background, in yet another scene ( this time a fine porcelain piece) we see an Indian “ queen” riding an alligator, while holding a parrot and cornucopia .*
- *‘The Frenchman’s Bride’—by Miller—represents the policy of the French crown to create a racially mixed group that would support French expansion in North America...*
- *Miller also painted Fort Laramie on the plains with lots of (apparently peaceful) Indians around it—whether this was a stylized image or not, we don’t know but it clearly represents the advance of the white man into ‘uncivilized’ territory. The Indians in the picture appear to be acquiescent (but who knows for sure? Hence the fort).*
- *There are several pieces of hyperbolic poetry in the selections from, “Sample Antebellum Poetry with Indian Themes” among them, ‘Take Back These Baubles’ (Powhattan)—an anonymous poem printed in 1826( Worcester Magazine & Historical Journal (April 1826))in which the noble Indian chief is portrayed as resisting European ‘honors’ in favor of his own “noble savage” traditions.*
- *Are some of the above indicators of protest against removal/expulsion? (Jim Moran pointed out that some samples of protest against the Cherokee Removal can be seen at the American Antiquarian Society’s site: [www.teachushistory.org](http://www.teachushistory.org) ;<http://www.teachushistory.org/indian-removal> (including a petition against removal by the ladies of Steubenville Ohio: <http://www.teachushistory.org/indian-removal/resources/petition-ladies-steubenville-oh-against-indian-removal-0> )*

### **11:00 – 11:10 – Break**

- 11:10-12 NOON “Lo, The Poor Indian”: Literary ‘Removals’ in Antebellum America – Tom Doughton

- *There were various stories about 'forbidden love' between whites and Indians—fictionalized romances usually between European men and Indian women that emerged in the first part of the 19<sup>th</sup> century—some of them mildly scandalous at the time. The underlying theme seems to be about the absorption of Indian blood (and thence, legitimacy???) into the white population that 'inherits' the land.*
- *In the story of Chief Thundersquall and Miss Ann Carter—the daughter of Boston white aristocrats the Indian chief and the Puritan girl fall madly and scandalously in love in spite of everything her parents can do to discourage her. In the real Boston of 1630 (the time in which the story—written in 1830—is set) no such thing would have or could have happened. But the story encourages the myth that somehow the dominant population had a 'legitimate' inheritance in the land of the now "disappeared" native peoples.*
- 12:00 – 1:00 – Working Lunch – Dining Room of the Goddard-Daniels House
- *Discussions about the morning sessions and their possible applications in the classroom*
- 1:00 – 2:30 – Workshop with Library materials – Council Room, Antiquarian Hall
- *In this first part of the session we were broken into three small groups in order to look at images from McKenney's & Hall's, "Indian Tribes of North America", an extraordinary and rare set of portfolio color engravings and "biographical sketches and anecdotes of the Principal Chiefs". Using "Visual Literacy Worksheets" created by Jim Moran (of the AAS) members of the groups were asked to list various elements in the images, captions and words, date of creation, lines, color, symbolism, and the "feelings" that they evoked in the observers. Participants were also asked to consider what ideas and emotions the producer of the volumes was trying to evoke—how the creator of the work may have intended his audience to respond. This led to discussions about who the original audience was (in this case people and institutions who had money to spend on such an expensive work) and what more we would like to learn about it (as well as where we might find more information).*
- *Once again, though highly sympathetic to the subjects of his work (so much so that Andrew Jackson removed him from his post as federal Indian agent), McKenney could not transcend the dominant society's assumptions about the irreversible process of disappearance.*

Following this we looked at more images—this time of locations in New York and New England (hills, lakes, and mountains that were somehow associated with Indians or Indian folklore **on the part of whites**)

- *Once again, in three small groups, we looked at mountain and lake engravings/pictures from the early 19<sup>th</sup> century depicting places associated with Indians along with narratives that*

*described those associations. These, too, reiterated the common themes of noble (if dangerous) savages doomed to die as a result of their inability to fit in—or of Indian legends created wholly or in part by whites to romanticized the “disappeared/disappearing” natives of the region. (Was this just another way of making a ‘legitimate’ connection with the original people?)*

- 2:30 – 2:45 – Break
- 2:45 – 3:45 – Teach Back Discussion
- *The main topic of discussion had to do with how to take the content materials (from the morning lectures) and the “hands-on” materials (primary source documents, images, etc.) that we are receiving at these workshops and turn them into actual lesson plans for the classroom which fit in with the state curriculum frameworks (extremely important for public school teachers at every level).*
- *Suggestions were made that perhaps the afternoon sessions could include a period of time when teachers would get together in small groups to begin the process of creating actual lesson plans. One of the motivating factors mentioned for the time to create a lesson plan was to have Tom and Jim right there to answer requests for possible further documentation, i.e. what other documentation exists, or is a specific viewpoint available.*
- *(In a short discussion after the close of the workshop Jim Moran, Tom Doughton, and John Daly determined that these suggestions should be given highest priority as we plan for the next few workshops and for the Summer Institute in particular. The blog site might be useful for teachers to continue discussions about lesson plans ideas they came up with and outlined in the afternoon “teach back” session, as it is unlikely that a full set of plans could be finished in a single afternoon. At the Summer Institute a required concrete outcome might be for each teacher/group of teachers to produce and report on a completed lesson plan at the end of the institute or start of the workshop year. This topic will be carefully considered at the next Steering Committee Meeting.)*
- 3:45 – 4:00 – Feedback Forms